SDG 4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

MEETADATA

Target 4.7  By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

4.7.1 Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development are mainstreamed in (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment

Definition
The indicator measures the extent to which countries mainstream Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in their education systems. This is an indicator of characteristics of different aspects of education systems: education policies, curricula, teacher training and student assessment as reported by government officials, ideally following consultation with other government ministries, national human rights institutes, the education sector and civil society organizations. It measures what governments intend and not what is implemented in practice in schools and classrooms.

For each of the four components of the indicator (policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment), a number of criteria are measured, which are then combined to give a single score between zero and one for each component. (See methodology section for full details).

The indicator and its methodology have been reviewed and endorsed by UNESCO’s Technical Cooperation Group on the Indicators for SDG 4-Education 2030 (TCG), which is responsible for the development and maintenance of the thematic indicator framework for the follow-up and review of SDG 4.
**Purpose**

In order to achieve SDG targets 4.7, it is necessary for governments to ensure that ESD and GCED and their sub-themes are fully integrated in all aspects of their education systems. Students will not achieve the desired learning outcomes if ESD and GCED have not been identified as priorities in education policies or laws, if curricula do not specifically include the themes and sub-themes of ESD and GCED, and if teachers are not trained to teach these topics across the curriculum.

This indicator aims to give a simple assessment of whether the basic infrastructure exists that would allow countries to deliver quality ESD and GCED to learners, to ensure their populations have adequate information on sustainable development and lifestyles in harmony with nature. Appropriate education policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment are key aspects of national commitment and effort to implement GCED and ESD effectively and to provide a conducive learning environment.

Each component of the indicator is assessed on a scale of zero to one. The closer to one the value, the better mainstreamed are ESD and GCED in that component. By presenting results separately for each component, governments will be able to identify in which areas more efforts may be needed.

In 1974, UNESCO Member States adopted the Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, which encapsulates many of the aims of SDG targets 4.7, 12.8 and 13.3. Every four years countries report on the implementation of the Recommendation. This well-established formal mechanism will be the data source for indicator 4.7.1/12.8.1/13.3.1. The seventh quadrennial reporting round is scheduled to take place in 2020.

**Calculation method**

Information collected with the questionnaire for monitoring the implementation by UNESCO Member States of the 1974 Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms will be used for the construction of the global indicator. For each of the four components of the indicator (policies, curricula, teacher education, and student assessment), a number of criteria are measured, which are then combined to give a single score between zero and one for each component. Only information for primary and secondary education will be used for calculation of indicator 4.7.1/12.8.1/13.3.1.

(a) **Laws and policies**

The following questions are used to calculate the policies component of the indicator:

* A2: Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are covered in national or sub-national laws, legislation or legal frameworks on education.
There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) and two levels of government (national and sub-national) = 16 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank the component score is not calculated.

Note that ‘not applicable’ is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if eight of the 16 responses are ‘not applicable’, the sum of the 0 and 1 scores is divided by 8 to get the mean and not by 16).

A4. Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are covered in national or sub-national education policies, frameworks or strategic objectives.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

A5. Please indicate whether national or sub-national education policies, frameworks or strategic objectives on education provide a mandate to integrate GCED and ESD.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) and five areas of integration (curricula, learning objectives, textbooks, teacher education, and student assessment) = 10 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that ‘not applicable’ is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.
Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if five of the 10 responses are ‘not applicable’, the sum of the 0 and 1 scores is divided by 5 to get the mean and not by 10).

E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (laws and policies) please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed\(^1\) in education laws and policies in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that ‘not applicable’ is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is ‘not applicable’, the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1 as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

Policy component score = simple mean of the scores for questions A2, A4, A5 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

(b) Curricula

The following questions are used to calculate the curricula component of the indicator:

B2: Please indicate which GCED and ESD themes are taught as part of the curriculum.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

\(^1\) GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities), and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers), as appropriate.
Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that responses to ‘other subjects, please specify’ in the question are ignored. If appropriate, during quality assurance answers in this category may be recoded to one of the other 12 subjects.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

**B3. Please indicate in which subjects or fields of study GCED and ESD are taught in primary and secondary education.**

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) and twelve subjects in which they may be taught (arts; civics, civil or citizenship education; ethics/moral studies; geography; health, physical education and sports; history; languages; mathematics; religious education; science; social studies and integrated studies) = 96 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank the question score is not calculated.

Note that responses to ‘other subjects, please specify’ in the question are ignored. If appropriate, during quality assurance answers in this category may be recoded to one of the other 12 subjects.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

**B4. Please indicate the approaches used to teach GCED and ESD in primary and secondary education.**

There are four teaching approaches (GCED/ESD as separate subjects, cross-curricular, integrated, whole school) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.
E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (curricula) please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed\(^2\) in curricula in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that ‘not applicable’ is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is ‘not applicable’, the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1, as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

Curricula component score = simple mean of the scores for questions B2, B3, B4 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

(c) Teacher education

The following questions are used to calculate the teacher education component of the indicator:

C2: Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to teach GCED and ESD during initial or pre-service training and/or through continuing professional development.

There are two types of training (initial/pre-service and continuing professional development) and two types of teachers (of selected subjects in which ESD/GCED are typically taught, and of other subjects) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

\(^2\) GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities), and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers), as appropriate.
If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

C3. Please indicate on which GCED and ESD themes pre-service or in-service training is available for teachers, trainers and educators.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

C4. Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to teach the following dimensions of learning in GCED and ESD.

There are four learning dimensions (knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes/behaviours) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1, and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

C5. Please indicate whether teachers, trainers and educators are trained to use the following approaches to teach GCED and ESD in primary and secondary education.

There are four teaching approaches (GCED/ESD as separate subjects, cross-curricular, integrated, whole school) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.
E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (teacher education), please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed in teacher education in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable (which is ignored). Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that ‘not applicable’ is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is ‘not applicable’, the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1, as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

Teacher education component score = simple mean of the scores for questions C2, C3, C4, C5 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

(d) Student assessment

The following questions are used to calculate the student assessment component of the indicator:

D2: Please indicate whether the GCED and ESD themes below are generally included in student assessments or examinations.

There are eight GCED/ESD themes (cultural diversity and tolerance, gender equality, human rights, peace and non-violence, climate change, environmental sustainability, human survival and well-being, and sustainable consumption and production) = 8 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

---

3 GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities) and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers), as appropriate.
If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

D3. Please indicate which of the dimensions of learning in GCED and ESD below are generally included in student assessments or examinations.

There are four learning dimensions (knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes/behaviours) = 4 responses.

Response categories are no = 0, yes = 1 and unknown, which is treated as zero. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Question score = simple mean of the 0 and 1 scores.

E1. Based on your responses to questions in the previous section (student assessment), please indicate to what extent global citizenship education (GCED) and education for sustainable development (ESD) are mainstreamed\(^4\) in student assessment in your country.

There are two levels of government (national, sub-national) = 2 responses.

Response categories are not at all = 0, partially = 1, extensively = 2, unknown (treated as zero), and not applicable, which is ignored. Blanks are also treated as zeros.

If more than half of responses excluding not applicables are unknown or blank, the component score is not calculated.

Note that ‘not applicable’ is used where only one level of government is responsible for education.

Question score = half the simple mean of the 0, 1 and 2 scores, excluding not applicables (i.e., if one of the two responses is ‘not applicable’, the sum of the 0, 1 and 2 scores is divided by 2 to get half the mean and not by 4). The score is half the mean in order to ensure it lies between 0 and 1, as do the scores for the other three questions in this section.

Student assessment component score = simple mean of the scores for questions D2, D3 and E1 (except where the component score should not be calculated because too many responses were unknown or blank).

\(^4\) GCED and ESD are mainstreamed if they or their themes and sub-themes are mentioned explicitly in relevant documents and are expected to be implemented by the relevant authorities (e.g. Ministries, regional or local education authorities), educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges and universities) and/or education professionals (e.g. teachers and lecturers) as appropriate.
The component scores all lie between zero and one and are presented as a dashboard of four scores. They are not combined to create a single overall score for the indicator. The higher the score, the more GCED and ESD are mainstreamed in the given component. In this way, users can make a simple assessment in which component area more efforts may be needed.

**Interpretation**

Acknowledging that evidence on how the policy guidance and implementation in policy, curricula, teacher training and student assessment actually work and what impact they may have, progress might be interpreted in relation to the comparative/ipsative priority and emphasis assigned to these areas over time, i.e. if and how existence, frequency, priority and scope of implementation change from one data collection to the next.

**Type of data source**

Responses to the quadrennial reporting by UNESCO Member States on the implementation of the 1974 *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms*. The next round of reporting is scheduled to take place in 2020.

**Disaggregation**

None.

**Data required**

Information on the extent to which a given country is mainstreaming global citizenship education and education for sustainable development in their education polices and systems.

**Data sources**

Requests for reports are submitted to Ministers Responsible for Relations with UNESCO who are typically Education Ministers. Reports are usually completed by government officials in Ministries of Education. Countries are requested to consult widely before submitting their reports. To assist with this, requests for reports are also copied to NGOs in official partnership with UNESCO and to OHCHR. Prior to release of the results, national data providers and national statistical offices are invited to review the results and, if appropriate, raise any concerns.

**Quality assurance**

- UNESCO will review country responses for consistency and credibility and, if necessary, queries will be raised with national respondents. To assist with this, from
2020, countries will be asked to provide, in addition to completed questionnaires, supporting evidence of their responses in the form of documents or links (e.g. to education policies, laws, curricula, etc.). These will be made publicly available along with completed questionnaires after results are published. UNESCO will also take into account alternative sources of information, where available. These may include national responses to similar intergovernmental consultation processes, such as the Council of Europe’s consultations on the Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education, the UN Economic Commission for Europe’s consultations on the Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development, or other information on ESD and GCED in countries’ national education systems.

- Any proposed changes to response values in the questionnaire as the result of quality assurance procedures will be communicated to and verified with countries by UNESCO. Final results will be shared with countries before publication (i) by UNESCO with the national data providers and (ii) by the UIS with education statistics and SDG indicator focal points as part of its annual SDG indicator verification exercise.

**Limitations and comments**

The indicator is based on self-reporting by government officials. However, countries will be asked to provide supporting evidence in the form of documents or links (e.g. education policies or laws, curricula, etc.) to back up their responses. In addition, UNESCO will compare responses with available information from alternative sources and, if appropriate, raise queries with national respondents. At the end of the reporting cycle, country responses and the supporting documents will be made publicly available.