Results of the TCG survey of thematic indicators

Technical Cooperation Group (TCG) meeting
26-28 October 2016
Madrid, Spain
Overall results

- Nearly 60 respondents
  - 28 TCG-affiliated (Members, Observers, organizations)
  - 30 others (including countries, civil society, academia and non-TCG affiliated organizations)

- Regional representation
  - 43% developed regions
  - 25% global (i.e. organizations, civil society, etc)
  - 14% Latin America and the Caribbean
  - 11% Africa
  - 8% Asia
## Overall results by target

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target</th>
<th>% support (all respondents)</th>
<th>% support (TCG only)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Literacy and numeracy</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Primary and secondary</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.c Teachers</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.a School environment</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.b Scholarships</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Early childhood</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Global citizenship</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Equity</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 TVET and tertiary</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Skills for work</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Overall results by thematic indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target</th>
<th>% support (all respondents)</th>
<th>% support (TCG only)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Literacy and numeracy</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Primary and secondary</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.c Teachers</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.a School environment</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.b Scholarships</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Early childhood</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Global citizenship</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Equity</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 TVET and tertiary</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Skills for work</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By target</td>
<td>By thematic indicators</td>
<td>Change in ranking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Literacy and numeracy</td>
<td>4.6 Literacy and numeracy</td>
<td>=</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Primary and secondary</td>
<td>4.c Teachers</td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.c Teachers</td>
<td>4.1 Primary and secondary</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.a School environment</td>
<td>4.2 Early childhood</td>
<td>+2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.b Scholarships</td>
<td>4.3 TVET and tertiary</td>
<td>+4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Early childhood</td>
<td>4.5 Equity</td>
<td>+2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Global citizenship</td>
<td>4.4 Skills for work</td>
<td>+3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Equity</td>
<td>4.a School environment</td>
<td>-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 TVET and tertiary</td>
<td>Global citizenship</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Skills for work</td>
<td>4.b Scholarships</td>
<td>-5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Preliminary conclusions

- Indicators for Targets 4.1, 4.6 and 4.c are well supported

- Indicators for Targets 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 4.5, 4.7, 4.a and 4.b require further consideration either because
  - As a group they do not represent well the ambitions of the targets; or
  - Individually, they require further conceptualisation and/or methodological development
Cross-cutting issues

- **Disaggregation**: by sex, disability, migratory status, conflict-affected and others should be made explicit indicator by indicator
- **Periodicity**: should be defined for each indicator
- **Vulnerable groups**: Disaggregation of indicators is not sufficient. Specific indicators need to be developed reflecting the specific challenges of such groups
Summary results by target
4.1 Primary and secondary education

- Indicators very well-supported.
- 4.1.2 should compliment global indicator 4.1.1
- Further methodological work required on 4.1.1 being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning
- Possible additional indicators
  - Out-of-school numbers
  - Household expenditures on education
  - Transition rates –primary/lower secondary, lower/upper secondary)
- Could consider dropping
  - 4.1.3 (gross intake ratio to the last grade of primary) which is a proxy completion rate. 4.1.4 (completion rate) is now relatively widely available
4.2 Early childhood

- Indicators moderately well-supported.
- Further methodological work required on 4.2.1 being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning.
- Concerns regarding 4.2.3 (positive/stimulating home environment). Further methodological work would be required.
- Possible additional indicators:
  - Net enrolment rate in early childhood education (ISCED 01+02)
  - Household expenditures on education
  - % of new entrants to primary with early childhood education experience
- Could consider dropping:
  - 4.2.4 (gross pre-primary enrolment ratio) which is similar to global indicator 4.2.4 which is available for 150 countries.
4.3 TVET and higher education

- Indicator set does not capture quality, affordability or equal access for men and women.
- Further development work required on 4.3.1 to increase country coverage.
- Possible additional indicators:
  - Net enrolment rate or new entrants rate to tertiary (instead of 4.3.2).
  - Move 4.4.3 (educational attainment) to 4.3.
  - Gender parity indices to measure equality of access.
  - An outcome indicator (e.g., transition to work, graduation or completion).
- Could consider dropping:
  - 4.3.2 (gross tertiary enrolment ratio) if replaced by a net rate.
- May need to develop:
  - Measures of quality and affordability.
4.4 Skills for work

- Indicator set does not capture the broad range of skills needed for decent work
- Further methodological and development work required on 4.4.1 and 4.4.2 being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning
- Possible additional indicators
  - An employment-related indicator such as youth/adult employment rate
  - Literacy and numeracy indicators (eg from 4.6)
- Could consider dropping
  - One of the ICT skills indicators
  - 4.4.3 (educational attainment) and move to 4.3
- May need to develop
  - Measures of other relevant work-related skills
4.5 Equity

- Questions regarding the **relevance** of some indicators to target
- Further **methodological and development work required on 4.5.2** (language of instruction) and **4.5.3** (funding formula)
- Possible **additional indicators**
  - Expand 4.5.4 to separately identify household expenditures on education
  - Expand 4.5.5 to cover at least lower middle income countries
- Could consider **dropping**
  - Indicators only loosely related to the target
- May need to **develop**
  - Equity measures of relevance to specific vulnerable groups (conflict-affected, disabled etc)
4.6 Literacy and numeracy

- Indicators **very well-supported**.
- Further **developmental work required on 4.6.1** being led by the Global Alliance to Monitor Learning
- Possible **additional indicators**
  - Numeracy rates (similar to 4.6.2 for literacy)
  - Existence of legal frameworks guaranteeing access to literacy and numeracy programmes
- Could consider **modifying**
  - 4.6.3 to refer to participation of illiterate youth/adults in literacy programmes
- May need to **develop**
  - Measures of completion of literacy/numeracy programmes
4.7 Global citizenship and sustainability

- Indicator set is **very ambitious** and not easy to implement.
- Further **methodological work required on most indicators**
- Possible **additional indicators**
  - Existence of legal frameworks concerning key concepts of the target (e.g., human rights, gender equality, peace and non-violence etc)
- Could consider **dropping**
  - 1-2 indicators to simplify the set
- May need to **develop**
  - 4.7.4 and 4.7.5 (knowledge of citizenship and ecoscience)
  - 4.7.3 (human rights)
  - Measures of peace and non-violence
  - Measures of values and attitudes as opposed to knowledge
4.a School environment

- Indicator set contains some **challenging indicators**.
- Further **conceptualisation and methodological work required**
- Possible **additional indicators**
  - Existence of **mechanisms for reporting** violence including bullying in schools
- May need to **develop**
  - **4.a.3** (attacks) and **4.a.1 (d)** (adapted infrastructure) need further conceptualisation and methodological development
  - Data sources for **4.a.2** (violence) beyond the Global School-based Student Health Survey
  - Measures of the structural safety of buildings and equipment
  - Measures regarding codes of conduct in schools (both staff and students)
4.b Scholarships

- Only one thematic indicator which requires substantial further developmental work to identify suitable sources of data
- Possible additional indicators
  - None that can be implemented without further methodological development
- May need to develop
  - 4.b.2 (scholarships) needs further work to identify suitable sources
  - Measures of expenditure on and scholarships for students from disadvantaged backgrounds or marginalised communities
4.c Teachers

- Indicators very well-supported.
- Possible additional indicators
  - Expand indicators to cover post-secondary education
  - Existence of national teaching councils or regulatory frameworks for teachers
- Could consider dropping
  - Indicators only loosely related to the target (eg 4.c.5 on salaries) or those similar to other indicators (eg 4.c.7 on training)
- May need to develop
  - International minimum standards for teacher training and qualifications to improve cross-national comparability
  - 4.c.7 (in-service training) needs further conceptualisation and methodological development
Next steps
Working groups

- Four groups covering different clusters of targets
  - **Group 1**: Targets 4.1, 4.2 and 4.6
  - **Group 2**: Targets 4.3, 4.4 and 4.7
  - **Group 3**: Targets 4.5 and 4.b
  - **Group 4**: Targets 4.a and 4.c
Tasks to accomplish

☐ For each target under review:

☐ Establish a set of indicators which has broad agreement including the global indicator(s) for reporting in 2017

☐ Identify indicators which need further conceptualisation or methodological development